

TAX TREATY INTERPRETATION

THE MEANING AND APPLICATION OF ARTICLE 3(2)

RICHARD XENOPHON RESCH

PH.D. (LEIDEN UNIVERSITY),

LL.M. (VIENNA UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION),

D.B.S. (LONDON SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND POLITICAL SCIENCE),

B.A. (UNIVERSITY OF YORK)

MUNICH, GERMANY

4TH MAY 2020

Cover: tredition/Richard X. Resch
Editing and Layout: Richard X. Resch

Published & Printed by: tredition GmbH, Halenreihe 40–44, 22359 Hamburg, Germany
ISBN: 978-3-347-05882-8 (Paperback)
ISBN: 978-3-347-05883-5 (Hardcover)

Copyright © 2020 Richard X. Resch

All rights reserved. Without written permission from the copyright owner, no part of this publication may be used, reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, translated, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying, scanning, recording, or any other electronic or mechanical methods, except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical reviews and other non-commercial uses permitted by copyright law. Inquiries concerning permission should be sent to richard.resch@gmail.com.

Bibliographic information of the German National Library: The German National Library records this publication in the German National Bibliography; detailed bibliographic data is available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

CONTENTS

Abbreviations	xv
Editorial Notes	xvii
Preface	xxi
Acknowledgements	xxii
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Scientific Contribution	1
1.2 Research Question	1
1.3 Motivation	2
1.4 Structure	8
1.5 Methodology	10
1.6 Terminology	11
1.6.1 Established Misnomers	11
1.6.2 German/English View	11
1.6.3 Lex Fori/Autonomous/Contextual Approach	12
1.6.4 Text(s)	13
2 Preliminary Considerations	15
2.1 Introduction	15
2.2 Civil Versus Common Law	17
2.2.1 Case Law	17
2.2.2 Doctrine	22
2.2.3 Interpretation	24
2.3 Conclusions	25
3 The German View in Doctrine	29
3.1 Introduction	29
3.2 Autonomous Interpretation Versus Lex Fori	29
3.3 Doctrinal Foundations	31
3.4 An Inner-German Schism	37
3.5 The New Vienna School	41
3.6 Conclusions	43
4 German Case Law	45
4.1 Introduction	45
4.2 Lex Fori	46
4.2.1 Income Qualification	46
4.2.1.1 I 112/57 S, 20.01.1959	46
4.2.1.2 I 216/64, 29.11.1966	48
4.2.1.3 I R 207/66, 06.10.1971	49
4.2.1.4 I B 50/68, 11.03.1970	49

Contents

4.2.1.5	I R 52/69, 18.07.1973	50
4.2.1.6	I R 52/83, 18.12.1986	51
4.2.1.7	I R 111/08, 02.09.2009, et seq.	52
4.2.1.8	I R 52/16, 11.07.2018	53
4.2.1.9	I R 73/16, 27.2.2019	54
4.2.2	Entity Qualification	54
4.2.2.1	I 216/63, 26.04.1966	54
4.2.2.2	I R 95/10, 25.05.2011	55
4.2.2.3	I R 47/12, 12.06.2013	58
4.2.2.4	I R 48/12, 26.06.2013	59
4.2.2.5	I R 42/15, 11.10.2017	60
4.2.2.6	I R 44/16, 11.07.2018	61
4.3	Departures from Lex Fori	64
4.3.1	Contextual Interpretation	64
4.3.1.1	I R 176/66, 02.05.1969	64
4.3.1.2	I B 50/68, 11.03.1970	66
4.3.1.3	I R 81/09, 28.04.2010	67
4.3.1.4	I R 103/10, 22.06.2011	69
4.3.1.5	I R 4/13, 11.12.2013	70
4.3.1.6	I R 98/15, 20.12.2017	71
4.3.2	Autonomous Interpretation	72
4.3.2.1	III R 125/69, 15.01.1971	72
4.3.2.2	III R 118/70, 15.06.1973	74
4.3.2.3	I R 63/80, 21.08.1985	75
4.3.2.4	I R 179/86, 30.05.1990	76
4.3.2.5	I R 6/11, 06.06.2012	78
4.3.2.6	I R 42/02, 25.02.2004	79
4.3.2.7	I R 94/09, 09.06.2010	81
4.3.2.8	I R 53/09, 26.08.2010	82
4.3.2.9	I R 92/09, 08.12.2010	83
4.3.2.10	I R 93/10, 12.10.2011	85
4.4	Conclusions	86
5	Critique of the German View	91
5.1	Introduction	91
5.2	Fundamental Flaws	91
5.2.1	Gospel In, Gospel Out	91
5.2.2	A False Dichotomy	95
5.3	The Problem with Language	101
5.3.1	A Contracting State	102
5.3.2	Application	102
5.3.3	Unless	103
5.4	The German Tax Treaty Network	107
5.4.1	General Overview	107
5.4.2	Treaties with OECD Countries	107
5.4.2.1	English Prevailing Text	107
5.4.2.2	Unilingual	108

5.4.2.3	Plurilingual Without Prevailing Text	108
5.4.3	Treaties with Non-OECD Countries	110
5.4.3.1	English Prevailing Text	110
5.4.3.2	No Prevailing Text, English Text	111
5.4.3.3	No Prevailing Text, No English Text	112
5.4.3.4	Non-English Prevailing Text/Unilingual	112
5.5	Conclusions	113
6	The English View and Its Critics	117
6.1	Introduction	117
6.2	The ITG Approach	117
6.2.1	The Initial Submission	117
6.2.2	Déry and Ward’s Reformulation	125
6.3	The Unfinished Discussion	129
6.3.1	Vogel’s Critique	129
6.3.2	Comparison of the Approaches	131
6.3.3	Rust’s Adaptation	134
6.3.4	Avery Jones’s Suggestion	134
6.3.5	Summary Observations	135
6.4	Conclusions	136
7	Vogel’s Critique: A Reconsideration	139
7.1	Introduction	139
7.2	Taxable and Exempt	139
7.3	Fundamental Treaty Mechanics	143
7.4	May be Taxed and Shall be Taxable Only in Articles 6–22	147
7.5	May be Taxed in Article 23	153
7.6	Conclusions	161
7.7	Annex: The 1977 Update	164
8	The Application of Articles 3(2) and 23	169
8.1	Introduction	169
8.2	A Recap of the BFH’s Position	171
8.3	The Structural Design of the OECD Model	173
8.4	The Perspectivism of Tax Treaties	179
8.5	Asymmetrical and Symmetrical Common Interpretation	181
8.6	The Temporal Logic of Tax Treaties	189
8.7	Conclusions	196
9	Context and the OECD Commentary	201
9.1	Introduction	201
9.2	The Lang–Avery Jones Controversy	201
9.2.1	Everything but Domestic Law	201
9.2.2	The Tale of Two Contexts	202
9.2.3	Unless the Context Otherwise Requires	203
9.2.4	Vogel’s Position	206

Contents

9.3	Evaluation	207
9.3.1	Lang and Vogel	207
9.3.2	Avery Jones	207
9.3.3	The Role of the OECD Commentary	211
9.3.4	The Relationship Between Articles 31 and 3(2)	215
9.3.5	A Holistic Synthesis	217
9.3.6	The Pragmatist Response	224
9.4	Conclusions	230
9.5	Annex: The Application of Article 31(4)	233
10	Conclusions	237
10.1	Introduction	237
10.2	Synopsis	237
10.3	Policy Recommendations	245
	Epilogue	247
	Sources	251
	Case Law	251
	International	251
	National	251
	Australia	251
	Canada	251
	France	251
	Germany	251
	India	253
	Ireland	253
	Norway	253
	Poland	253
	Sweden	253
	Switzerland	253
	United Kingdom	253
	United States	253
	Laws/Circulars	254
	Treaties/Commentaries/Explanatory Statements	254
	Model Conventions/Commentaries	254
	Legal Databases/Websites	255
	Literature	255
	Commentaries	255
	Handbooks/Guides	256
	Reports	256
	Books/Collections	256
	Book Contributions	258
	Articles	259
	Working Papers	263
	Press	263
	Online	263

Contents

Other 264
 Dictionaries 264
 Encyclopedia Entries 264
 Manuals 264
Colophon 265